

APPENDIX S

SUMMARY OF CONSULTATIONS

No.	Consultation Event	Participants	Stakeholder category	Date and location	No. of participants	Purpose of Consultation	Topics discussed and issues raised
1	One-on-one meetings (x5)	Village residents of Tetri Aragvi and Khadistskail gorge settlements	Affected communities	4 April 2018, various	Approx. 5	EIA discussions	• Gather information on project area's aquatic environment
2	One-on-one meetings (x5)	Village residents of Natvani, Baidara, and Tergi	Affected communities	11 April 2018, various	Approx. 5	EIA discussions	• Gather information on project area's aquatic environment
3	One-on-one meetings (x8)	Village residents of Tskere, Kobi	Affected communities	19 April 2018, various	Approx. 8	EIA discussions	• Gather information on project area's biodiversity
4	One-on-one meetings (x3)	Village residents of Zakatkari	Affected communities	8 May 2018, Zakatkari	Approx. 3	EIA discussions	• Gather information on project area's biodiversity
5	One-on-one meetings (x6)	Residents of settlements along Kvesheti-Kobi alignment	Affected communities	12 May 2018	Approx. 6	EIA discussions	• Gather information on project area's cultural heritage
6	Public meeting	Village residents of Kvesheti	Affected communities	14 May 2018, Kvesheti	Approx. 16 (15 males, 1 female)	Introduce the project specifications and discuss issues related to the LARP	• Participants need more information about the road project • Questions from participants on basic project aspects such as scope, size, and potential benefits • Challenges with the land-registration process and eligibility to compensation

No.	Consultation Event	Participants	Stakeholder category	Date and location	No. of participants	Purpose of Consultation	Topics discussed and issues raised
							• Interest in employment opportunities
7	Public meeting	Village residents of Kvesheti, Arakhveti and Khada, NGO representatives	Affected communities and interested stakeholders	10 July 2018, Kvesheti	Approx. 16 (11 males, 5 females)	To disclose the EIA Scoping Report and to collect feedback	• General interest in project benefits • Project impacts on building and cultural heritage • Stakeholder engagement in project design and decision-making process
8	Public meeting	Village residents of Kobi, NGO representatives	Affected communities and interested stakeholders	10 July 2018, Kobi	Approx. 11 (6 females, 5 males)	To disclose the EIA Scoping Report and to collect feedback	• Project impacts on protected areas and cultural heritage • Project impacts on utilities and infrastructure • Question whether the project had undergone a Strategic Environmental Protection Assessment
9	Civil society meeting	NGOs, residents, government representatives	Affected communities, national, regional and local administrations, NGOs and local associations	13 August 2018, Ministry of Environmental Protection and Agriculture, Tbilisi	Approx. 27 (15 males, 12 females)	EIA consultation with civil society experts	• More information required on the alternatives analyzed • Project impacts on protected areas • Quality of procedure for the scoping public consultation, and amount of participation • Project impacts on current eco-tourism activities in the Khada valley • Queries about construction techniques particularly for the tunnel

No.	Consultation Event	Participants	Stakeholder category	Date and location	No. of participants	Purpose of Consultation	Topics discussed and issues raised
10	Focus group discussion	Residents of Begoni, Beniani, Gomurni, Sviana-Rostiani, Tskere.	Affected communities	30 August 2018, Begoni Plateau	Approx. 10 (6 males, 4 females)	Land Acquisition and Resettlement planning	• Tskere's access to the proposed road • Land registration challenges • Potential for vibration effects on homes during construction/operations of the road • Question on whether the road will have lighting • Impact on the gas pipeline near Kobi during construction phase • Project impacts on identified grazing and hay collection areas, water sources for villages on the plateau • No specific development plans are in place for the Khada valley, although there are state/national level programs to support people who want to develop a business plan
11	Focus group discussion	Residents of Arakhveti Begoni, and Kvesheti villages	Affected communities	31 August 2018, Arakhveti and Kvesheti	Approx. 11	Land Acquisition and Resettlement planning	• Questions on crossing points along the road, particularly for cattle • Questions on service road alignment • Impact on tourism • Project impacts on existing infrastructures (water, telecommunications, etc.)

No.	Consultation Event	Participants	Stakeholder category	Date and location	No. of participants	Purpose of Consultation	Topics discussed and issues raised
							• Request that an upgrade to the sewerage system is performed together with the project • Bedoni village: discussion on access road alignment through the riverbed to avoid using the current road that passes through the middle of the Bedoni village • Road alignment in the Kvesheti village and impacts the project may have on properties and on quality of life in the village
12	Focus group discussion	Residents of Kobi Almasiani villages	Affected communities	31 August 2018, Kobi	Approx. 8 (6 men, 2 women)	Land Acquisition and Resettlement planning	• Impact on St George Cross and the church above it • Discussion about the Soldiers Monument • Impact on gas pipeline alignment during construction • Questions on project schedule • Discussion on possible spoil disposal sites and when/how these will be decided • Development plan is being developed and currently waiting Prime Ministers approval; mainly relates to the ski lift development
13	Civil society meeting	NGOs, businesses, authority representatives	National government authorities, NGOs, local	4 September 2018, Tbilisi	Approx. 28 (17 males, 11 females)	EIA consultation with civil society experts	• Questions on geophysical aspects, particularly for the tunnel section

No.	Consultation Event	Participants	Stakeholder category	Date and location	No. of participants	Purpose of Consultation	Topics discussed and issues raised
			associations, affected businesses				• Adequacy of information/details in the EIA Scoping Report and participation challenges • Location of spoil area and construction camps • Request that evaluation of impacts on habitats is performed according to IUCN guidelines • Project impacts on accessibility to cemeteries and cultural monuments • Impacts on current tourism activities and expectations on possible development opportunities • Impacts on archaeological heritage • More information required on the alternatives analysis that has been performed
14	Public meeting	Residents of Kvesheti, Arakhveti, Benian-Begoni, Kobi, Tskere, and Zaqtakari villages, Representatives of NGOs and government	Affected communities, national NGOs, national and local government authorities	7 September 2018, Mleta	Approx. 60	Disclosure of project alignment and alternatives considered	• Questions on the alternative analysis performed • Question on the reasons behind the chosen road alignment • Clarifications about land acquisition and compensation
15	Expert meeting	Representative from Georgian Center for	National NGO	10 September 2018, Tbilisi	1	EIA consultation with civil society	• Discussion of community support programs, wildlife information and available data

No.	Consultation Event	Participants	Stakeholder category	Date and location	No. of participants	Purpose of Consultation	Topics discussed and issues raised
		the Conservation of Wildlife					
16	Expert meeting	Representative from NACRES	National NGO	10 September 2018, Tbilisi	1	EIA consultation with civil society	• Discussion regarding status of NACRES conservation programmes, biodiversity in the project area and grounds for delimitation of Emerald network sites
17	Expert meeting	Representative from MOEPA biodiversity department	National government	11 September, 2018, Tbilisi,	1	EIA consultation with civil society	• Discussion about biodiversity in the project area
18	Expert meeting	Representatives from Caucasus Nature Fund	International NGO	11 September, 2018, Tbilisi	2	EIA consultation with civil society	• Discussion regarding CNF activities in Georgia, main issues, plans, ways for cooperation during wildlife monitoring
19	Public meeting	Residents of Begoni and Beniani villages	Affected communities	14 September 2018, Begoni	Approx. 10 (6 males and 4 females)	Land Acquisition and Resettlement planning	• Potential impact of challenges with land registration on compensation entitlements • Impacts on agricultural activities • Interest in potential economic benefits
20	Public meeting	Residents of Tskere village	Affected communities	14 September 2018, Tskere	Approx. 4 (3 females, 1 male)	Land Acquisition and Resettlement planning	• Interest in the project due to the accessibility benefits that it would bring to the village • Difficulties registering land

No.	Consultation Event	Participants	Stakeholder category	Date and location	No. of participants	Purpose of Consultation	Topics discussed and issues raised
21	Public meeting	Residents of Kvesheti village	Affected communities	15 September 2018, Kvesheti	Approx. 25 (20 males, 5 females)	Land Acquisition and Resettlement planning	• Some residents commented the road should be built on the other side of the river • Some opposition to the project due to potential impacts on properties and houses • More information on project design alternatives required
22	Public meeting	Residents of Zakatkari village	Affected communities	15 September 2018, Zakatkari	Approx. 6 (4 males, 2 females)	Land Acquisition and Resettlement planning	• Issues around land acquisition and resettlement process and eligibility criteria • Access benefits of the new road
23	Expert meeting	Georgian Centre for Biodiversity Conservation and Research (NACRES) representative	National NGOs	26 September 2018, Tbilisi	2	Gather baseline data and information on project area biodiversity	• Provided information on NACRES' work • NACRES offered to support the biodiversity aspects of the project and valued the biodiversity assessment work done thus far
24	Expert meeting	Georgian Centre for the Conservation of Wildlife representative	National NGOs	26 September 2018, Tbilisi	2	Gather baseline data and information on project area biodiversity i	• Provided information about KfW-supported protected area project involving Kazbegi National Park • Highlighted issues between local people and protected area development due to strict controls impacting livelihoods

No.	Consultation Event	Participants	Stakeholder category	Date and location	No. of participants	Purpose of Consultation	Topics discussed and issues raised
25	Expert meeting	Caucasus Nature Fund (CNF) representatives	International NGOs	28 September 2018, Tbilisi	3	Gather baseline data and information on project area biodiversity	• Provided information on CNF work and issues relevant to Kazbegi National Park such as poaching, land use zoning, and tourism • CNF raised questions about the project regarding impacts on Khada valley, alternative options to the proposed road, and ongoing freight transport issues and transport pollution
26	Expert meeting	Biodiversity and Forest Department, MoEPA representative	National Government	28 September 2018, Tbilisi	2	Gather baseline data and information on project area biodiversity	• Provided information expansion plans for Kazbegi National Park and plans for the Emerald Network • Commented the road project impacts likely relatively benign, but pointed out impacts on sea buckthorn areas need to be avoided
27	Focus group discussion	Women from Kvesheti	Affected communities	16 October 2018, Kvesheti	n/a	LARP discussions	n/a
28	Focus group discussion	Women from Tskere	Affected communities	16 October 2018, Tskere	n/a	LARP discussions	n/a
29	Focus group discussion	Women from Beniani-Begoni	Affected communities	16 October 2018, Beniani Begoni	n/a	LARP discussions	n/a
30	Focus group discussion	Women from Kobi	Affected communities	17 October 2018, Kobi	/na	LARP discussions	n/a

No.	Consultation Event	Participants	Stakeholder category	Date and location	No. of participants	Purpose of Consultation	Topics discussed and issues raised
31	Expert meeting	SABUKO representative	National NGOs	16 November 2018, Tbilisi	2	Gather baseline data and information on project area biodiversity	• Provided information on SABUKO work in the area • Emphasized that the endangered Egyptian vulture is in the project area
32	Public meeting	Residents of Kobi village, representatives of SABUKO, Green Alternative, Mountain Development Center	Affected communities and interested stakeholders	10 December 2018, Kobi	Approx. 17 (11 males, 6 females)	Disclose the draft EIA and gather initial feedback	• Potential impact of construction to nearby shrines • Higher involvement of communities in assessment phase, ie for cultural heritage sites in the area • Questions asked and answered regarding alternative options to the Khada valley bypass • Total cost of the project
33	Public meeting	Residents of Mleta Bedoni, Arakhveti, Kvesheti village, representatives of 5 NGOs	Potentially affected and interested stakeholders	10 December 2018, Mleta	Approx. 29 (18 males, 11 females)	Disclose the draft EIA and gather initial feedback	• Technical questions raised about geo-engineering aspects and the disposal of construction spoil • Positive comment on the quality of the EIA • Issues with the land registration process
34	Public meeting	Residents of Begoni, Arakhveti, Kvesheti villages, local government,	Potentially affected stakeholders, local government	9 January 2019, Mleta	30	Public hearing on the LARP	• Generally positive and constructive • Issues with the land registration process.
35	Expert meeting	Georgian Eco-Tourism Association	National NGO	30 January 2019, Tbilisi	5	Discussions on potential eco-tourism component of project	• Information provided on the Association's work

No.	Consultation Event	Participants	Stakeholder category	Date and location	No. of participants	Purpose of Consultation	Topics discussed and issues raised
							• Agreed that the Khada valley has considerable eco-tourism potential • Comment that more analysis needed than in the EIA to assess socio-economic and cultural heritage aspects to plan appropriate and sustainable tourism activities • Suggested no need for another tourist center
36	Expert meeting	CENN	National NGO	1 February 2019, Tbilisi	12	Discussions on potential eco-tourism component of project	• Commented that upgrading the existing road is the preferable option as concerns over the impacts on the Khada valley • Another meeting earmarked to discuss more in depth the technical reasons why upgrading the existing road not feasible
37	Expert meeting	SABUKO	National NGO	1 February 2019, Tbilisi	6	Discussions on potential eco-tourism component of project	• Commented that the EIA assessment of bird biodiversity data needed more work and offered to provide more data • Agreed that eco-tourism activities had good potential, but must be community-based and involve capacity building support
38	Expert meeting	WWF	International NGO	1 February 2019, Tbilisi	10	Discussions on potential eco-tourism component of project	• Quite positive about the project and the potential eco-tourism benefits for the area

No.	Consultation Event	Participants	Stakeholder category	Date and location	No. of participants	Purpose of Consultation	Topics discussed and issues raised
							• Offered to collaborate on the biodiversity action plan for the project
39	Meeting	Mayor of Dusheti	Local government	4 February 2019, Dusheti	8	Discussions on potential eco-tourism component of project	• Mayor highlighted Khada valley tourism development desirable and good potential, but so far constrained by seasonality and lack of infrastructure • Welcomed the proposed Gudauri access road initiative of the project and also the potential of a tourist visitor center supported by the project.
40	Meeting	Mayor of Kazbegi	Local government	4 February 2019, Stepantsminda	8	Discussions on potential eco-tourism component of project	• Mayor said municipality/residents very supportive of the project as current road has major problems that impact tourism • Interested in project support for tourism initiative on Kobi side of the project area.
41	Public meeting	Residents of Zakatkari, Kaishaurebi and Jaghmiani villages	Affected communities	6 March 2019, Kaishaurebi	40	Public hearing on the LARP	• Information sought on how to resolve land registration challenges and the impact on compensation. • Residents were positive about the project's proposed support of a tourist hub facility and shared ideas on how it could support local livelihoods.

